Analysis of paths selection modes for Add-Paths

draft-vvds-add-paths-analysis-00

Virginie van den Schrieck Olivier Bonaventure Pierre Francois

Agenda

- Quick reminder
- Rule out some path selection modes?
- Next

Add-Paths

 How to advertise multiple paths over a single iBGP session

Goal

- draft-ietf-idr-add-paths-01.txt
 - Encode multiple paths to same NLRI over a BGP session
 - Doesn't tell which paths to select for advertisement
 - Different applications lead to different selection modes
 - (maybe) No interop issues when different path selection modes are applied by speakers in an AS

Goal

- Informational draft
 - List the modes in one draft
 - Evaluate them (what it gives, what it costs)
 - Track potential interop issues

Modes

- All paths
- N paths (max)
- AS-Wide best paths
- Neighbor-AS group best paths
- Best Loc Pref / Second best Loc Pref paths
- Decisive step I
- (put your favorite mode here)

| | Path optimality | Backup availability / optimality | Control plane load and stress | DP Complexity | MED osc. avoidance |
|------------|--------------------|--|-------------------------------|-----------------------|-----------------------|
| AII | OK | ОК | Max | EASIEST | OK |
| N | good | OK / ~OK | Bounded | Hard or Okay (MED) | good |
| LPI/LP2 | OK | ОК | ~MAX | EASIER | OK |
| Decisive-I | OK | ОК | ~MAX | Easy but "complex" | OK |
| AS-Wide | OK | KO / ~OK | ~MAX | EASY | OK |
| Group best | KO | КО | ~MAX | ? | OK |

| | Path optimality | Backup availability / optimality | Control plane load and stress | DP Complexity | MED osc. avoidance |
|------------|--------------------|--|-------------------------------|-----------------------|-----------------------|
| All | OK | ОК | Max | EASIEST | OK |
| Ν | good | OK / ~OK | Bounded | Hard or Okay (MED) | good |
| LPI/LP2 | OK | ОК | ~MAX | EASIER | OK |
| Decisive-I | ОК | ОК | ~MAX | Easy but "complex" | OK |
| AS-Wide | OK | KO / ~OK | ~MAX | EASY | OK |
| Group best | KO | КО | ~MAX | ? | OK |

| | Path optimality | Backup availability / optimality | Control plane load and stress | DP Complexity | MED osc. avoidance |
|------------|--------------------|--|-------------------------------|-----------------------|-----------------------|
| All | OK | OK | Max | EASIEST | OK |
| Ν | good | OK / ~OK | Bounded | Hard or Okay (MED) | good |
| LPI/LP2 | OK | OK | ~MAX | EASIER | OK |
| Decisive-I | OK | ОК | ~MAX | Easy but "complex" | OK |
| AS-Wide | OK | KO / ~OK | ~MAX | EASY | OK |
| Group best | KO | КО | ~MAX | ? | OK |

| | Path optimality | Backup availability / optimality | Control plane load and stress | DP Complexity | MED osc. avoidance |
|------------|--------------------|--|-------------------------------|-----------------------|-----------------------|
| AII | OK | ОК | Max | EASIEST | OK |
| Ν | good | OK / ~OK | Bounded | Hard or Okay (MED) | good |
| LPI/LP2 | OK | OK | ~MAX | EASIER | OK |
| Decisive-I | ОК | ОК | ~MAX | Easy but "complex" | ОК |
| AS-Wide | OK | KO / ~OK | ~MAX | EASY | OK |
| Group best | КО | КО | ~MAX | ? | OK |

| | Path optimality | Backup availability / optimality | Control plane load and stress | DP Complexity | MED osc. avoidance |
|------------|--------------------|--|-------------------------------|-----------------------|-----------------------|
| All | ОК | ОК | Max | EASIEST | OK |
| Ν | good | OK / ~OK | Bounded | Hard or Okay (MED) | good |
| LPI/LP2 | OK | OK | ~MAX | EASIER | OK |
| Decisive-I | OK | ОК | ~MAX | Easy but "complex" | OK |
| AS-Wide | OK | KO / ~OK | ~MAX | EASY | ОК |
| Group best | KO | КО | ~MAX | ? | ОК |

| | Path optimality | Backup availability / optimality | Control plane load and stress | DP Complexity | MED osc. avoidance |
|------------|--------------------|--|-------------------------------|-----------------------|-----------------------|
| All | ОК | ОК | Max | EASIEST | OK |
| Ν | good | OK / ~OK | Bounded | Hard or Okay (MED) | good |
| LPI/LP2 | OK | OK | ~MAX | EASIER | OK |
| Decisive-I | OK | ОК | ~MAX | Easy but "complex" | OK |
| AS-Wide | OK | KO / ~OK | ~MAX | EASY | OK |
| Group best | KO | KO | ~MAX | ? | ОК |

| | Path optimality | Backup availability / optimality | Control plane load and stress | DP Complexity | MED osc. avoidance |
|------------|--------------------|--|-------------------------------|-----------------------|-----------------------|
| All | OK | OK | Max | EASIEST | OK |
| Ν | good | ок / ~ок | Bounded | Hard or Okay (MED) | good |
| LPI/LP2 | OK | ОК | ~MAX | EASIER | OK |
| Decisive-I | OK | ОК | ~MAX | Easy but "complex" | OK |
| AS-Wide | OK | KO / ~OK | ~MAX | EASY | OK |
| Group best | KO | КО | ~MAX | ? | OK |

Add-N-Paths

- My preferred
 - Does what we're really looking for
 - Bounded, "easily" predictable overhead
- If you'll only implement one, pick this one
 - Fails to provide some guarantees

Coming soon Mix

- Different modes on different routers
 - Vendors making different choices
- Different modes for different sessions
 - One vendor allowing different modes for different "session types"

"Session type" dependent mode

- Do Add-All-Paths / Add-LPI-LP2
 - over sessions with your RRs
 - over normal sessions
- Do Add-2-Paths
 - over session with your RR clients

Why?

- No longer issue a show ip bgp on your ASBRs...
- Fast BGP Add-Path Control Plane Convergence
 - RR -> RR-client updates only
- ASBRs loaded/stressed like with Add-2-Paths

Coming soon configuring add-paths (?)

- per AFI/SAFI
- per prefix
- per session type
- "dynamic"