Draft-ietf-avt-rtcp-xr-mib-00.txt

Authors: Alan Clark, Amy Pendleton

Current draft status

- WG draft (renamed as -00.txt)

- Added section on relationship to RAQMON

  - RAQMON authors provided suggested wording

- Updated MIB

Mail List Comments

- Magnus comments:
  - MW1: The XR MIB needs to be defined in such a way that it can easily be extended if more report types are created.
    - Agree. This will be covered in the next version.
  - MW2: THE XR MIB should define structures for all the currently defined XR report blocks.
    - The original intention was to capture the VoIP block only but this should be easy to cover.
  - MW3: The security consideration section also seems to be a bit strange, is it mostly copy and pasted from the RTP MIB?
    - Agree. This will be changed in the next version.
  - MW4: How can the SSRC be a session identifier?
    - In many implementations, the SSRC is used to uniquely identify a session. Without tying the implementation of VoIP media to any signaling standard, this appears to be the least common denominator.
    - Other thoughts?

…Mail List Comments

- ## Magnus comments continued:
  - MW5: How are sessions with more than a single destination handled?
    - The intention was to generate one entry per destination since each will potentially have a different set of values for the metrics.
  - MW6: Questions on vocoder, frame, and sample rate.
    - The intention was allow for flexibility for vocoder description since it is common practice to use dynamic payload types. Thus the type is currently defined as a string.
    - The frame and sample rate values need some thought. The intention was to accommodate both narrowband and wideband audio and both fixed and variable rates.

…Mail List Comments

- ## Dan's comments:
  - The RAQMON work is generic and complementary in concept to RTCP-XR, covering a wider range of applications running concurrently, possibly on different protocols, while RTCP-XR focuses on QoS monitoring of media traffic of RTP sessions.
    - With some minor alteration to acknowledge the use of RTCP XR as targeted specifically at reporting voice quality rather than generically reporting packet network impairments, this is acceptable.
  - SNMP comments

Intended scope of MIB

- Primary application - VoIP management
- Examples:-
  - VoIP gateway, may accumulate multiple sets of call data and collect RTCP XR VoIP metrics from remote endpoint
  - Probe, may collect metrics from mid-stream measurements
  - IP phone, less likely but could be used to poll IP phone for VoIP metrics
- RTCP XR initially focused on point-to-point sessions, does not address conferencing

Next Steps

- Comments?