Problems with draft-ietf-fax-tiff-fx-11.txt Interoperability Report Proposal for Next Steps

Wrong Document

- Report says "RFC 2301"
- Document being progressed is "draft-ietffax-tiff-fx-11.txt
- Substantive differences between the two documents
 - GlobalParametersIFD for F
 - JBIG options
 - image/tiff-fx MIME type

Latest report doesn't document interoperability

- Latest report lists implementations, and features of implementations
- No discussion of what worked and what didn't work in latest report
- Previous report said that "most" worked, not all
- Perfect interoperability is rare
- What features worked with 2 independent implementations?

Implementations not Independent same company or same source

- Latest report includes many implementations from same company no assertion of independence
- Previous report and latest report have overlapped implementations
- Many implementations in previous report use shared code from common sources (Markus Kuhn free JBIG library)

Implementations not Independent... "replaceable components"

- Definition of 'interoperable' in RFC 2026: can replace one component with another
- Many "Internet Fax" implementations!
- "TIFF-FX profile L writer" not interoperable with "Internet Fax" product

No evidence of IPR licensing

- Some features of TIFF-FX require licensing Press releases from Microsoft & ScanSoft declaring licensing in 2000, 2001
- Patent issued to Xerox July 1998, after publication of RFC 2301
- IPR release from Xerox requires licensing
- RFC 2026 requires "statements from implementors" and "independent exercise of licensing agreement"

Many Features Have Insufficient Implementations Listed

- Even counting "unqualified" implementations
- Features with no implementation: e.g., 12 bits-per-sample profile C
- Features with only one writer
 profile M
- Features with only one reader profile L 1-bit RGB, 1-bit CMY, 1-bit CMYK
- Features with unclear status
 GlobalParameterIFD with profile F, S

Proposal for Interoperability

- Determine 'qualified' implementations
 - Independent of each other
 - statement that "all needed licenses obtained" (either licensed or license unnecessary)
- Ask sending implementations to send "Internet Fax" messages using File Format
 - To collection mailbox
 - Enough to cover all "features" implemented
- Send messages on to receivers
 - See which messages are correctly received
- Go through document, enumerating features
 - See which features are sent by two and can be received correctly by two
- Remove features which aren't implemented by multiple independent inteorperable implementations which meet qaulifiecations