draft-wenger-avt-avpf-ccm-01.txt

Magnus Westerlund

List of Changes

- **Restructuring to remove redundancy in descriptions**
- **Freeze picture request has been removed**
  - Functionality is better implemented in the forward RTP stream using the Singer extension draft
  - No proposal yet
- **Section with usage scenarios and topologies added**
- **Changes message formats**
  - Semantic Ack as agreed in Paris
- **Multicast improvements**
  - Identify the "recipient" of a feedback message (the media sender)
    - Necessary when more than one RTP sender is in a given session
  - Added information how to react to contradicting feedback messages from different receivers
- **Added section on "design principles of the extensions"**
  - Making clear that the extensions MUST NOT be used as a session control

Open Issues / Questions to WG

- **Temporal-Spatial Tradeoff-Ack**
  - Currently, signals back the tradeoff chosen by the media sender. This is already more feedback than today's video systems implement. But we could add:
  - "Request received, but can' t grant", and "Request granted (as follows)"
  - Or remove tradeoff completely?
- **TMMA feedback message**
  - Currently does not signal back the "now in force" maximum bit rate
  - One could argue that its not necessary, because a media sender must use this (or a lower) bitrate
  - However, in some cases (for example when only a few pre-defined media bit rates can be generated), it may make sense that the media sender informs the receiver about his chosen bitrate, which may be *lower* than the one suggested by the media receiver.
  - Add that feature?
- **Transmission timing rules**: are they adequate as stated in the draft?
- **Dave Singer's concern in Paris**: repeating requests do not work when the request sender gets no information back whether the sender can satisfy the request. Is this now appropriately addressed?

Conclusion

- Draft is making progress

- Accept as WG item?